### DL systems over finite fields IV Example for index calculus attack

Tanja Lange

Eindhoven University of Technology

2MMC10 - Cryptology

# Schoolbook version stage 1

Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, 
$$j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$$
. Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$ 

Put the relations in a matrix. Note, inhomogenous system. Use linear algebra to compute a solution to the system modulo  $\operatorname{ord}(g)$ . Output result  $(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_f)$ .

If system under determined, collect more relations.

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$ 

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$ 

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$ 

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$ 

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer *j*.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, ..., e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  we got a relation. (1, 1, 1, 0, 12)

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer *j*.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  we got a relation. (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$  another relation. (1, 2, 1, 0, 82)

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  we got a relation. (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$  another relation. (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{\mathbf{e}_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$   $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  we got a relation. (1, 1, 1, 0, 12)  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$  another relation. (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$  we got a relation. (0, 1, 0, 1, 7)

Example: **F**<sub>107</sub> with g = 2, h = 99. Define factor base  $\mathcal{F} = \{p_i | p_i \text{ prime }, p_i < B\}$  for some bound *B*. Let  $f = |\mathcal{F}|$ .  $\mathcal{F} = \{2, 3, 5, 7\}, f = 4$ 

Repeat the following until f + 4 relations are collected.

- 1. Pick random integer j.
- 2. Compute  $g^j$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^f p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so,  $j = \sum e_i \log_g(p_i)$ . Store relation  $(e_1, e_2, \dots, e_f, j)$  $g^{23} = 22 = 2 \cdot 11$  not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  we got a relation. (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$  another relation. (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$  we got a relation. (0, 1, 0, 1, 7)

Let's be optimistic (we also have g = 2, so may have enough relations). Tanja Lange DL systems over finite fields IV

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

$$\left(\begin{array}{ccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & | & 12 \\ 1 & 2 & 1 & 0 & | & 82 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & | & 7 \end{array}\right) \sim \left(\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & | & 70 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & | & 47 \\ \end{array}\right)$$

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

$$\left(\begin{array}{ccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & | & 12 \\ 1 & 2 & 1 & 0 & | & 82 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & | & 7 \end{array}\right) \sim \left(\begin{array}{ccccccccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & | & 70 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & | & 47 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & | & 43 \end{array}\right)$$

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Put the relations in a matrix. Note, inhomogenous system. Use linear algebra to compute a solution to the system modulo  $\operatorname{ord}(g)$ . Output result  $(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_f)$ .

$$\left(\begin{array}{ccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & | & 12 \\ 1 & 2 & 1 & 0 & | & 82 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & | & 7 \end{array}\right) \sim \left(\begin{array}{cccccccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & | & 70 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & | & 47 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & | & 43 \end{array}\right)$$

Note: Computations are modulo p - 1 = 106

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Put the relations in a matrix. Note, inhomogenous system. Use linear algebra to compute a solution to the system modulo  $\operatorname{ord}(g)$ . Output result  $(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_f)$ .

$$\left(\begin{array}{cccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & | & 12 \\ 1 & 2 & 1 & 0 & | & 82 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & | & 7 \end{array}\right) \sim \left(\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & | & 70 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & | & 47 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & | & 43 \end{array}\right)$$

Note: Computations are modulo p-1 = 106 which is not prime. Here everything worked, else could have computed modulo 53, gotten  $\bar{a}_i$ , and then for each  $1 \le i \le f$  checked whether  $a_i = \bar{a}_i$  or  $a_i = \bar{a}_i + 53$  is correct.

Relations: (1, 0, 0, 0, 1) from  $g^1 = 2$  (1, 1, 1, 0, 12) from  $g^{12} = 30 = 2 \cdot 3 \cdot 5$  (1, 2, 1, 0, 82) from  $g^{82} = 90 = 2 \cdot 3'^2 \cdot 5$ (0, 1, 0, 1, 7) from  $g^7 = 21 = 3 \cdot 7$ 

Put the relations in a matrix. Note, inhomogenous system. Use linear algebra to compute a solution to the system modulo  $\operatorname{ord}(g)$ . Output result  $(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_f)$ .

$$\left(\begin{array}{cccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & | & 12 \\ 1 & 2 & 1 & 0 & | & 82 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & | & 7 \end{array}\right) \sim \left(\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & | & 70 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & | & 47 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & | & 43 \end{array}\right)$$

Note: Computations are modulo p-1 = 106 which is not prime. Here everything worked, else could have computed modulo 53, gotten  $\bar{a}_i$ , and then for each  $1 \le i \le f$  checked whether  $a_i = \bar{a}_i$  or  $a_i = \bar{a}_i + 53$  is correct. In general work modulo largest divisor of p-1 for which matrix is invertible, then search residue class of  $\bar{a}_i$ .

# Schoolbook version stage 2

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i \mod ord(g)$ .

- ▶ Many optimizations to improve smoothness chance for *b* in stage 1.
- Make structured choices of j to enable sieving.
- Many optimizations of number-field sieve for factoring carry over. Best index calculus attack for F<sub>p</sub> also called number-field sieve and uses number fields and sieving.
- Asymptotic cost  $L^{c+o(1)}$  for constant c where  $L = \exp((\ln n)^{1/3} (\ln \ln n)^{2/3})$

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i \mod ord(g)$ .

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i \mod \operatorname{ord}(g)$ .  $h = 99 = 3^2 \cdot 11$ ,

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i$  modulo ord(g).  $h = 99 = 3^2 \cdot 11$ , this is not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth.

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i$  modulo ord(g).  $h = 99 = 3^2 \cdot 11$ , this is not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth. Try a few more powers of g, eventually find

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i$  modulo  $\operatorname{ord}(g)$ .  $h = 99 = 3^2 \cdot 11$ , this is not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth. Try a few more powers of g, eventually find  $g^{31}h = 98 = 2 \cdot 7^2$ .

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i$  modulo ord(g).  $h = 99 = 3^2 \cdot 11$ , this is not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth. Try a few more powers of g, eventually find  $g^{31}h = 98 = 2 \cdot 7^2$ .  $a \equiv 1 + 2 \cdot 43 - 31 \equiv 56 \mod 106$ .

This part uses the target h.

Repeat the following until successful

- 1. Pick random integer k.
- 2. Compute  $g^k h$  in  $\mathbf{F}_p$ . Consider result as integer  $b \in [0, p-1]$ .
- 3. Check whether b factors over the factor base, i.e. whether

$$b = \prod_{i=1}^{f} p_i^{e_i} ext{ for } p_i \in \mathcal{F}, e_i \in \mathbf{N}$$

If so, output  $-k + \sum e_i a_i$  modulo ord(g).  $h = 99 = 3^2 \cdot 11$ , this is not  $\mathcal{F}$ -smooth. Try a few more powers of g, eventually find  $g^{31}h = 98 = 2 \cdot 7^2$ .  $a \equiv 1 + 2 \cdot 43 - 31 \equiv 56 \mod 106$ .

Always make sure to test:  $g^{56} = 99 = h$ .